IV. A. 3.

EVOLUTION OF THE WAR

U.S. AND FRANCE'S WITHDRAWAL FROM VIETNAM

1954 - 1956

#277

# UNITED STATES - VIETNAM RELATIONS

# 1945 - 1967

IV. A.3.

EVOLUTION OF THE WAR

U.S. AND FRANCE'S WITHDRAWAL FROM VIETNAM
1954 - 1956

FOOTNOTES

1. Bator, Victor, Vietnam - A [illegible], Oceana Publications, Dobbs Ferry, New York 1965; p. 177.

2. Le Monde, 5 June 1954, Bator, p. 213.

3. Paris Msg 366, 27 July 54 (S); Paris Msg 438, 30 Jul 54 (S); New York Times, 27 Aug 54, 3 Sep 54; Deptel 740 to Paris, 30 Aug 54 (S)

4. New York Times, 30 Dec 54. Bator, p. 150: When the Institute of Emission and the Exchange Office were transferred to the Government of South Vietnam (5 Jan 55) Diem proclaimed: "With the last and fundamental attribute of our sovereignty regained, henceforth complete independence of Vietnam has become a living reality."

5. Paris Msgs 366, 27 Jul 54 (S); 438, 30 Jul 54 (S)

6. Bator, pp. 175-182. (Bator quotes from the memoires of General Paul Ely: L'Indochine dans la Tourmente, Plon, Paris 1964)

6a. Bator, p. 146.

7. Military Grant aid given France for Indochina under the Military Development Assistance Program from 1950 through 1954, (cut off after Dien Bien Phu) totalled $710 million. Economic aid to the Associated States of Indochina totalled $827 million. John D. Montgomery, The Politics of Foreign Aid (New York: Praeger, 1964), 284.

8. LaCouture, Jean et DeVillers, Phillipe, La Fin d'Une Guerre, Editions du Seuil, Paris, 1960; p. 294.

9. State Department Draft Report, "Review of U.S. Policy in the Far East", 3 Aug 54 (TS)

10. Memorandum from Vice Admiral A.C. Davis for the Secretary of Defense, "Report on the Manila Conference" 12 Sep 54 (S).

11. NSC Record of Actions, 210th Meeting, 12 Aug 54; 211th Meeting, 18 Aug 54 (TS). Letter, Secretary of Defense Wilson to Secretary of State Dulles, 17 Aug 54 (TS).

12. Statement made at Bangkok meeting of Manila Pact Council members, 23 Feb 55, quote in 14 Sep 55 Memorandum for the Director, Office of NSC Affairs, Subject: "U.S. Policy in the Event of a Renewal of Aggression in Vietnam.". (S) from A.C. Davis, Vice Admiral, USN, Director, Office of Foreign Military Affairs, OASD/ISA.

13. NIE 63-5-54, 3 Aug 54, "Post-Geneva Outlook in Indochina".



E

14. Ibid.

15. Deptel 610 to Paris, 18 Aug 54 (S).

16. NSC 5429/2, 20 Aug 54 (TS). JCS arguments against dealing with the DRV are contained in the NSC Records of Meetings 210 and 211 (8 and 12 Aug 54). Saigon Msgs 336, 27 Jul 54 (S), 518, 10 Aug 54. (Ambassador Heath also argued against dealing with Hanoi because it would lead the South Vietnamese to think the US planned accommodation with the communists).

17. Paris Msg 2080, 15 Nov 54 (S)

18. NIE 63-5-54

19. State Department Report, "A U.S. Policy for Post-Armistice Indochina", 12 Aug 54 (S).

20. Paris Msg 481, 4 Aug 54 (S)

21. Deptel 1023 to Saigon, 14 Sep 54 (S). State Department Report, "A U.S. Policy for Post-Armistice Indochina"; 12 Aug 54. State Department Report, "Other Major Political Questions", 27 Aug 54. President Eisenhower states: "On August 17, I directed that aid to Indochina henceforth be given directly to the Associated States rather than France", in Mandate for Change (Doubleday, 1963), p. 361.

22. NSC 5429/2

23. NIE 63-5-54

24. Memorandum for Record, Meeting of General Valluy and Admiral Radford 3 Jun 54 (TS). Chief MAAG IC Msg 2062A to Department of the Army, 27113ZJul54 (S).

25. JCS Memorandum for the Secretary of Defense, Subject: "U.S. Assumption of Training Responsibilities in Indochina", 4 Aug 54 (TS)

26. Letter, Secretary of State Dulles to Secretary of Defense Wilson, 18 Aug 54 (TS)

27. JCS Memorandum for the SecDef, Subject: "U.S. Assumption of Training Responsibilities in Indochina", 22 Sep 54 (TS). State feared France and Britain would object to the JCS conditions and were loath to disclose them; Cambodia seemed unwilling to antagonize France by accepting them. JCS insistence was firm, however, and the establishment of a MAAG in Cambodia was stalled for several months until JCS views finally prevailed. The matter of a unilateral agreement itself was at least an indirect affront to France because the US apparently agreed to French demands for a joint training venture in Cambodia

during the Washington Conference of late September 1954. The agreement was loosely worded; U.S. and French interpretations differed--but the U.S. version prevailed. Chief of Naval Operations Memorandum for Record, "U.S.-French Talks Regarding Indochina," 27 Sep 54, 10 Oct 54 (TS); State Msg 99 to Phnom Penh, 13 Oct 54 (TS); State Msg 2213 to Saigon, 1 Dec 54 (S).

28. In a study of June 1954, the JCS had estimated some 2250 advisors would be required to train the Vietnamese military forces. MAAG Indochina was limited to 342 men.

29. JCS Memorandum for the Secretary of Defense, Subject: "Development and Retention of Forces in Indochina", 22 Sep 54 (TS).

30. Letter, Secretary of State to Secretary of Defense, 11 Oct 54 (TS).

31. JCS Memorandum for the Secretary of Defense, Subject: "Development and Training of Indigenous Forces in Indochina", 19 Oct 54 (TS).

32. NSC Record of Action, 218th Meeting, 22 Oct 54 (TS); Deptel 1679 to Saigon, 22 Oct 54 (S).

33. NSC Action 1250; cited in Memorandum for the Secretary of Defense from H. Struve Hensel (AID/ISA), Subject: "Development of Indigenous Forces in Indochina", 30 Oct 54 (TS).

34. JCS Memorandum for the Secretary of Defense, Subject: "Development of Indigenous Forces in Indochina", 17 Nov 54 (TS).

35. Memorandum for the President from Dulles; Subject: "General Collins' Recommendations Regarding Military Force Levels in Vietnam", 17 Nov 54 (TS).

36. NIE 63-5-54

37. Saigon Msgs 971, 11 Sep 54 (TS); 1036, 16 Sep 54 (TS); 1076, 17 Sep 54 (TS); 1204, 24 Sep 54 (TS); 933, 9 Sep 54 (S); 953, 954, 10 Sep 54 (S).

38. Saigon Msgs 1330, 5 Oct 54 (S); 1382, 8 Oct 54 (S); 1397, 10 Oct 54 (S); 1434, 13 Oct 54 (S); 1487, 18 Oct 54 (S); 1493, 19 Oct 54 (S).

39. Report of the Saigon Military Mission (SMM), 1954-1955 (S).

40. Paris Msgs 1927, 5 Nov 54 (S); 2036, 12 Nov 54 (S); 2211, 25 Nov 54 (S); 2240, 28 Nov 54 (S); 2272, 30 Nov 54 (C); 2290, 1 Dec 54 (C); Saigon Msg 1807, 12 Nov 54 (S).

41. Saigon Msgs 1036, 16 Sep 54 (TS); 1204, 24 Sep 54 (TS).

42. Saigon Msg 794, 29 Aug 54 (S).

43. Saigon Msgs 1150, 1154, 21 Sep 54 (TS); 1162, 22 Sep 54 (TS); 1185,



E

23 Sep 54 (TS); 1231, 25 Sep 54 (S).

44. Shaplen, Robert, The Lost Revolution, Harper and Row, (Colophon Edition) New York, 1966; p. 116

45. Shaplen, p. 116.

46. State Department Records: E/LaC D-D/1, "Establishment and Maintenance of a Stable Anti-Communist Government in Vietnam", 23 Sep 54 (S). E/LaC D-1/3, "Other Major Political Questions, Draft Minute of Understanding", 27 Sep 54 (S). E/LaC Memorandum 16, "Minute of Understanding" 4 Oct 54 (S). Deptel 1327 to Saigon, 1 Oct 54 (S).

47. Paris Msgs 366, 27 Jul 54 (S); 438, 30 Jul 54 (S).

48. Paris Msgs 377, 27 Jul 54 (S); 715, 20 Aug 54 (S).

49. State Department Records: E/LaC VM-3 "Minutes of Economic Sessions of Franco-American Bilateral Talks", 20 Oct 54 (TS). Deptel Paris 737, 28 Aug 54 (TS).

50. State Department Records: E/LaC D-31, "US Financial Assistance to French Union Forces in Indochina", 24 Sep 54 (TS). E/LaC VM-3, "Minutes of Economic Sessions of Franco-American Bilateral Talks", 2 Oct 54 (TS).

51. Paris Msg 715, 20 Aug 54 (S); Deptel to Paris 737, 28 Aug 54 (S); E/LaC Memorandum 14, "French Position Papers re Military Aid and Economic Assistance to the Associated States", 28 Sep 54 (S).

52. E/LaC MC-2: "Memorandum of Conversation, Smith-LaChambre Meetings", 29 Sep 54, 6 Oct 54 (TS). The statement referred to reads as follows: "Such (aid) programs will be planned and closely coordinated to assure maximum effectiveness through appropriate machinery established in agreement with interested governments." The obvious ambiguity invites conflicting interpretations.

53. E/LaC Memorandum 20: "Report to the Secretary of State (from Robertson) on Franco-American Bilateral Talks", 8 Oct 54, 22 Oct 54 (TS). E/LaC D-1/2, "US Relations with Cambodia, Laos, and Vietnam", 23 Sep 54 (TS).

54. Deptel 1565 to Paris, 29 Oct 54 (TS); Paris Msg 1898, 4 Nov 54 (S); Saigon Msg 1919, 21 Nov 54 (S); 1935, 23 Nov 54 (S); Deptel 2070 to Saigon, 22 Nov 54 (S).

55. Paris TEDUL 11, NIACT, 21 Oct 54 (TS).

56. Paris Msgs 2018, 1 Nov 54 (S); 1883, 3 Nov 54 (S); Deptel 1737 to Paris, 10 Nov 54 (S); NIE 63-7-54: "Probable Developments in South Vietnam, Laos and Cambodia through July 1956", 23 Nov 54. (This discusses strong sentiment in France to get rid of Diem in favor of someone less hostile to the Vietminh).

57. Paris Msg 2080, 15 Nov 54 (S).

58. Ibid.

59. Paris Msg 646, 15 Aug 54 (S); Saigon Msg 494, 8 Aug 54 (S).

60. Saigon Msgs 795, 29 Aug 54 (S); 507, 10 Aug 54 (S); 721, 24 Aug 54 (S). Paris Msg 646, 15 Aug 54 (S).

61. Paris Msg 1665, 29 Oct 54 (S).

62. New York Times, 11 Dec 54; Deptel to Saigon, 2413, 13 Dec 54 (C); Paris Msg 2542, 14 Dec 54 (C).

63. 83d Congress, 2d Session, Senate Committee on Foreign Relations: "Report of Senator Mike Mansfield on a Study Mission to Vietnam, Cambodia and Laos", 15 Oct 54.

64. Paris Msg 1608, 16 Oct 54 (S); Saigon Msgs 1478, 17 Oct 54 (S); 1501, 20 Oct 54 (S).

65. DULTE 5 from Paris, 21 Oct 54 (TS). Robert Shaplen, op.cit., p. 118, reports these comments by Kenneth Young: "We realized we had to proceed carefully with the French, so when they made clear their position on Diem, we sent a cable to Senator Mansfield, of the Foreign Relations Committee, who was abroad, asking him what he thought of Diem as Premier. Mansfield was an old friend of Diem's and we knew what the answer would be in advance, of course, but it stunned the French. While they then dropped their open campaign to dump Diem, it became apparent that they were still maneuvering behind the scenes toward the same objective, and we realized that while we still had to work with the French in Vietnam, we would have to adopt a more independent position."

66. NSC Record of Action, 218th Meeting, 22 Oct 54 (TS); TEDUL 14, NIACT, to Paris, 22 Oct 54 (TS); Paris Msgs 1718, 24 Oct 54 (TS); 1737, 25 Oct 54 (TS).

67. Memorandum of Conversation, Secretary of State Dulles, French Ambassador Bonnet, Subject: "Indochina," 26 Oct 54 (S).

68. Paris Msgs 1718, 24 Oct 54 (TS); 1737, 25 Oct 54 (TS).

69. Deptel 1565 to Paris, 29 Oct 54 (TS).

70. Paris Msgs 1835, 1836, 30 Oct 54 (TS).

71. Letter President D.D. Eisenhower to General J. Lawton Collins, 3 Nov 54 (TS).

72. Saigon Msgs 1761, 8 Nov 54 (S); 1830, 15 Nov 54 (TS); FAO Washington

USFOTO 263 to Paris and Saigon, 24 Nov 54 (S); (Ely and Collins' strong recommendation that the FEC be maintained in Vietnam overcame reservations of military and diplomatic leaders in Washington that it be withdrawn. Washington's reasoning: civil war, not overt aggression, threatened Vietnam -- and the FEC would not be used in a civil conflict; the immediate US objectives of restoring order in Vietnam and bolstering Diem were not furthered by the presence of French troops. Therefore, the FEC is not worth the cost of its upkeep.)

73. Paris Msg 2433, 8 Dec 54 (TS).

74. Saigon Msgs 2250 (NIACT), 13 Dec 54 (TS); 2024, 30 Nov 54 (S); 2261, 142300ZDec54 (C); Paris 2601, 19 Dec 54 (TS).

75. Paris Msg 2270, 31 Dec 54 (TS); Paris Msg 2870 (NIACT), 7 Jan 55 (TS); Deptel 2766 to Saigon, 7 Jan 55 (TS).

76. Saigon Msg 2455, 25 Dec 54.(TS).

77. Saigon Msgs 2660 (NIACT), 9 Jan 55 (TS); 2663, 101230ZJan55 (S); Paris Msg 2797, 3 Jan 55 (S).

78. Saigon Msgs 2453, 24 Dec 54 (S); 2676, 10 Jan 55 (TS); 2876, 221940Z Jan 55 (S).

79. Paris Msgs 3064, 20 Jan 55 (TS); 3195, 28 Jan 55 (TS); Deptel 2629 to Paris, 24 Jan 55 (TS); 2726 to Paris, 1 Feb 55 (TS); Saigon Msg 3343, 111757ZFeb55 (C). Franco-American cooperation often missing in other endeavors was fairly good in TRIM. Intrigues between French and U.S. personnel and French intrigues against Diem existed--but their interference with the task of directing and developing the VNA was not as great as it might have been. Even Lansdale--hardly an avid French supporter--says: "there was a job to be done", and credits some French officers for their competence and cooperating in doing the job. (SMM Report).

80. Paris Msg 2601, 19 Dec 54 (TS).

81. Paris Msg 2987, 14 Jan 55 (S).

82. Saigon Msg 2250 (NIACT), 13 Dec 54 (TS).

83. Ibid.

84. Saigon Msg 2303 (NIACT), 16 Dec 54 (TS).

85. Saigon Msg 2250, 13 Dec 54 (TS).

86. Memorandum for Walter S. Robertson (Assistant Secretary of State for the Far East) from Ambassador Donald R. Heath; Subject: "Comments on Saigon Telegram 2303", 17 Dec 54 (TS).

87. Deptel 2274 (NIACT) to Paris, 17 Dec 54 (TS); 2487 to Saigon, 17 Dec 54 (TS).

88. Paris 2601, 19 Dec 54 (TS).

89. Ibid.

90. Ibid.

91. Ibid.

92. Ibid.

93. Deptel 2585 to Saigon, 24 Dec 54 (TS).

94. Deptel 2872 to Saigon, 13 Jan 55 (TS); Paris Msg 3034, 18 Jan 55 (TS).

95. Secretary of Defense Memorandum to the JCS; Subject: "Reconsideration of Military Programs in Southeast Asia", 5 Jan 55 (TS).

96. JCS Memorandum for the Secretary of Defense; Subject: "Reconsideration of Military Programs in Southeast Asia", 21 Jan 55 (TS).

97. Memorandum for the Secretary of State from General Collins; Subject: "Report on Vietnam for the NSC", 20 Jan 55 (TS).

98. Ibid.

99. Secretary of Defense Memorandum to the JCS, et.al.; Subject: "Report on Vietnam for the NSC", 3 Feb 55 (TS).

100. Memorandum for Record: Meeting between Dulles, Robertson and Young, Subject: "Indochina", 29 Dec 55 (TS).

101. Saigon Msgs 3747, 10 Mar 55 (S); 4373, 6 Apr 55 (S).

102. SMM Report.

103. Deptel 2956 to Paris, 21 Feb 55 (S); Paris Msgs 3654, 1 Mar 55 (S); 3896, 15 Mar 55 (S).

104. Saigon Msgs 3384, 25 Mar 55 (S); 4096, 24 Mar 55 (S); Paris Msgs 4070, 24 Mar 55 (S); 4151, 26 Mar 55 (S).

105. SMM Report.

106. Saigon Msg 4192, 29 Mar 55 (S).

107. New York Times, 30 Mar 55. General Ely first denied any French interference with Vietnamese troop movements and said the VNA had been



E

issued all the gas and ammunition required. A few days later, however, Ely said the French had not restricted gas or ammunition "except for a few hours" during the fighting on March 29-30. Saigon Msgs 4292, 2 Apr 55 (TS); 4349, 6 Apr 55 (TS).

108. Saigon Msg 4230 (NIACT), 3/2341ZMar55 (S).

109. Saigon Msgs 4292, 2 Apr 55 (TS); 4264, 31 Mar 55.

110. SMM Report.

111. Ibid.

112. Ibid.

113. Saigon Msg 4382, 7 Apr 55 (TS).

114. Saigon Msg 4263, 31 Mar 55 (TS).

115. Saigon Msg 4399, 7 Apr 55 (TS).

116. Deptel 4438 (NIACT) to Saigon, 9 Apr 55 (TS); 4466, 11 Apr 55 (TS); 4575, 16 Apr 55 (TS).

117. Paris Msgs 4200, 28 Mar 55 (S); 4281, 4285, 2 Apr 55 (S); 4328, 5 Apr 55 (TS); 4395, 9 Apr 55 (TS).

118. Deptel 3510 (NIACT) to Paris, 4 Apr 55 (TS).

119. Deptel 3622 to Paris, 12 Apr 55 (S); Paris Msg 4498, 16 Apr 55 (S).

120. Paris Msg 4503, 17 Apr 55 (TS).

121. Paris Msgs 4576, 21 Apr 55 (TS); 4659, 26 Apr 55 (S).

122. SMM Report.

123. Deptel 4757 (NIACT) to Saigon, 27 Apr 55 (TS).

124. Deptels 3828 (NIACT) to Paris 27 Apr 55 (TS); 3849 to Paris, 28 Apr 55 (TS).

125. SMM Report.

126. Saigon Msgs 4860 (NIACT), 28 Apr 55 (S); 4881, 281515ZApr55 (S); 4943, 30 Apr 55 (S). Some French alleged that Diem had initiated the fighting, but U.S. officials claimed this was false, that the Binh Xuyen had started a coup.

127. Deptel 4831 (NIACT) to Saigon, 1 May 55 (TS).

128. Paris Msg 4746, 30 Apr 55 (TS).

129. Saigon Msgs 4926, 29 Apr 55 (S); 4951, 30 Apr 55 (S); 4928, 29 Apr 55 (C).

130. Saigon Msgs 4944, 30 Apr 55 (S); 4957, 30 Apr 55 (OUO).

131. SMM Report. Colonel Lansdale recruited Trinh Minh Thé to Diem's side in the fall of 1954, a significant achievement because of Thé's prestige in Cao Dai and other circles and because of Thé's several thousand troops. Lansdale was accused of having bribed Thé to win his support but vigorously denies this. However, the SMM did secretly reimburse Thé's Lien Minh forces who moved into Saigon and acted as Diem's palace guard in October. In January, most of the Lien Minh were integrated into the Vietnamese National Army. General Phuong, another Cao Dai leader, joined Diem's cabinet in September. His support for the premier was on-again-off-again through the fall and winter but he was fairly solidly behind Diem by the spring of 1955. Phuong's troops were integrated into the VNA on March 31, 1955.

132. SMM Report.

133. Saigon Msgs 4882, 28 Apr 55 (S); 4926, 29 Apr 55 (S); 4953, 30 Apr 55 (S); 2908, 29 Apr 55 (C).

134. Saigon Msg 4039, 4 May 55 (S).

135. Saigon Msgs 5005, 2 May 55 (S); 5047, 5049, 5054, 4 May 55 (S); 4867, (NIACT), 3 May 55 (S); Paris Msg 4814, 4 May 55 (S).

136. Saigon Msg 5103, 6 May 55 (S).

137. SECTO 8 from Paris, 8 May 55 (TS).

138. Ibid.

139. Ibid.

140. Ibid.

141. Ibid.

142. JCS Memorandum for the Secretary of Defense; Subject: "Indochina (Vietnam)" 9 May 55 (TS).

143. Saigon Msg 5145, 9 May 55 (TS).

144. SECTO 36 from Paris, 11 May 55 (TS).

145. SECTO 42 from Paris, 12 May 55 (TS).



E

146. Paris Msg 69, 6 Jul 55 (S).

147. Deptels to Saigon: 35, 5 Jul 55 (S); 53, 6 Jul 55 (S); 80, 9 Jul 55 (S); 155, 14 Jul 55 (S); 165, 15 Jul 55 (S); 179, 16 Jul 55 (S).

148. NSC 5519: Draft Statement, "US Policy on All-Vietnam Elections", 17 May 55 (TS). The JCS concurred in this draft policy with one crucial exception: the statement that a communist attack would be opposed "with US armed forces if necessary and feasible" was unacceptable. The Chiefs wanted it changed to say opposition to attack would be "by invoking the Manila Pact and taking vigorous action thereunder to repel the Communist military aggression." Obviously, unilateral U.S. action was to be avoided. (JCS Memorandum to the Secretary of Defense, Subject: NSC 5519, "U.S. Policy on All-Vietnam Elections") 19 May 55 (TS).

The NSC considered the problem of elections on 9 June and decided to shelve the draft NSC statement. Its main features had already been conveyed to Diem; it was felt no new policy toward an outbreak of hositlities was required. (Memorandum, Executive Secretary of NSC to NSC, "U.S. Policy on All-Vietnam Elections", 13 Jun 55 (TS)).

149. Deptels to Saigon 5347, 3 Jun 55 (S); 5731, 8 Jun 55 (S); 35; 5 Jul 55 (S).

150. New York Times, 17 Jul 55.

151. Saigon Msg 5677, 6 Jun 55 (S); Deptel 5438 to Saigon 11 Jun 55 (S).

152. Saigon Msgs 5706, 7 Jun 55 (S); 5731, 8 Jun 55 (S).

153. Paris Msgs 5513, 5514, 16 Jun 55 (S); 5601, 21 Jun 55 (S); 5776, 29 Jun 55 (S); 27, 2 Jul 55 (S); 183, 12 Jul 55 (S). Saigon Msg 5969, 24 Jun 55 (S).

154. Saigon Msg 381, 23 Jul 55 (S); Paris Msg 1460, 29 Sep 55 (S); 1757, 14 Oct 55 (S).

155. Paris Msg 2889, 17 Dec 55 (C); SECTO 17 from Paris, 17 Dec 55 (C).

156. Le Monde, 14 Dec 1955; Paris Msg 2886, 17 Dec 55 (S); New York Times 1 Nov 55; Saigon Msg 2671, 5 Jan 56 (S).

157. Press Conference, 23 Feb 56, in Le Monde, 24 Feb 56.

158. Saigon Msgs 2086, 14 Nov 55 (S); 2206, 23 Nov 55 (S); Paris Msg 3783, 21 Feb 56 (S).

159. Deptel 1931 to Saigon, 2 Dec 55 (S).

160. NIE 63-56, "Probable Developments in North and South Vietnam Through Mid-1957", 17 Jul 56; Saigon Msg 237, 24 Jul 56 (C).